



MINUTES OF THE ELECTORS' GENERAL MEETING, HELD AT THE TOWN HALL ON MONDAY, 4 FEBRUARY 2013 COMMENCING AT 6.50PM.

1. OPENING OF MEETING

1.1 Present

Mayor A Ferris Presiding Member
Cr B de Jong
Cr D Nardi
Cr S Martin
Cr R Olson
Cr M Rico
Cr A Wilson

Mr S Wearne Chief Executive Officer
Mr L Mainwaring Executive Manager Finance and Administration
Mr J Douglas Manager Planning Services
Ms S Cocks Principal Environmental Health Officer
Mr K Dyer Operations Manager
Ms J May Minute Secretary

An estimated 136 members of the public were also in attendance.

2. WELCOME TO GALLERY AND INTRODUCTION OF ELECTED MEMBERS AND STAFF

Mayor Ferris welcomed members of the public and then introduced elected members and staff.

Mayor Ferris acknowledged the presence of former Mayors Ian Handcock and Jim O'Neill.

Mayor Ferris also acknowledged the presence of former Member of Parliament Arthur Marshall and the candidate for the seat of Fremantle in the impending State election, Simone McGurk.

Mayor Ferris provided advice regarding the proposed conduct of the meeting.

3. APOLOGIES

Apologies were submitted on behalf of:

Cr Rob Lilleyman
Cr Cliff Collinson
Sophie & David Foster, 40 May Street
Jennifer Johns, 64 Allen Street
Anthea & Antony Jack, 8 Bolton Street
Mark David, Staton Road
Elizabeth Pippit

4. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS ANNUAL MEETING OF ELECTORS

Cr Wilson – Cr de Jong
That the Minutes of the Annual Meeting of Electors held on 6 February 2012 be received and confirmed. CARRIED

5. MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION

5.1 Contents of the Annual Report

Mayor Ferris gave a brief overview of Council's achievements for the year as contained in the Annual Report.

**5.2 General Business****5.2.1 East Fremantle Oval Precinct Project**

Maureen Flynn gave a brief outline of the community consultation process related to the 2008 East Fremantle Oval Masterplan and the findings of the community survey, which she stated was responded to by approximately 800 persons, and which indicated around 70% were not in favour of commercial or residential development on the A Class Reserve. Ms Flynn also noted there had been strong opposition to the Masterplan expressed by residents who attended the December 2008 Electors' Meeting, as reflected in the resolution which had been moved at that meeting.

Ms Flynn stated that despite this strong opposition, Council had now developed a Concept Plan which included commercial development and residential and aged housing and involved much more of the A Class Reserve being rezoned and sold.

In closing Ms Flynn stated she wished to acknowledge Cr Rico, who, she understood, was the only Councillor who had opposed the Concept Plan.

Mayor Ferris advised that the Concept Plan was only a starting point for consultation with the community. He advised that there were aspects of the Plan that he personally did not support however Council was now embarking on a consultation process that would allow all members of the community to have their say on the proposal. The Plan involved making the area more accessible to the general public, with the installation of pathways and removal of fencing, whilst still allowing the East Fremantle Football Club to play WAFL games and operate from the ground.

One resident asked how allowing residential and commercial development on the ground would make it more accessible and how the removal of fencing could be achieved when the football club required the ground for WAFL games.

Mayor Ferris advised that these were issues that would need to be worked through, however stated that he believed that the Marmion Street frontage lent itself to residential development.

Robyn Travers, noting the strength of opposition to the original Master Plan, asked how this document differed from the more recent Concept Plan.

Mayor Ferris outlined the differences and similarities, between the two plans.

Rebecca James noted Council had earlier refused the establishment of a community garden adjacent to Locke Park as it was not considered a suitable use of the land.

In response to a number of comments, at the invitation of the Mayor, the Manager Planning Services outlined the need to address the decaying infrastructure on the site and to expand the usage of the ground. Mr Douglas also drew the meeting's attention to the fact that Council was required to provide 600 extra dwellings within the Town, by 2031, under the State Government's Directions 2031 strategy. It was considered that the rezoning of parts of the Reserve to allow residential/aged/commercial development would provide funding necessary to develop a sporting complex for the East Fremantle Football Club and a range of other recreational pursuits.

A resident stated that Council should not reduce any of the existing green space within the Town.

Damien Flynn stated that community consultation had been non-existent to this point and noted that meetings had already been held with State Government officials in relation to



altering the A Class Reserve status of the Oval. Mr Flynn queried how the project had got this far without community consultation and stated that green space should not be sold off.

Mayor Ferris stated that there was always going to be community consultation and that the meetings with State Government officials had been at a very preliminary stage to gauge the Government's views on such a proposal.

Jim O'Neill stated that Council should be protecting residents and should have consulted the community on this issue. Mr O'Neill stated that if Council needed an extra 600 dwellings it should not be taking green space. Mr O'Neill strongly objected to the rezoning of any portion of the Reserve bounded by Moss, Marmion, Allen and Fletcher Streets.

Gerard McCann agreed with an earlier speaker that the Mayor's use of the word "I" throughout his responses tonight gave the impression that he was personally driving this project. Mr McCann stated this tone was not conducive to constructive dialogue between Council and residents at this meeting and suggested the Mayor use "we" instead of "I". Mr McCann stated that, with imagination, the redevelopment of the facilities at this ground could be achieved without the loss of any of the A Class Reserve and urged Council to seek input from the many intelligent community members present at the meeting. Mr McCann advised that he would be prepared to pay an extra \$100 pa in his rates for five years to finance the redevelopment of the site.

An Allen Street resident stated that sacrificing the A Class Reserve should not be used as a means to upgrade the football club facilities.

Arthur Marshall stated that the East Fremantle Football Club had a long association with the East Fremantle community and asked whether he could hear from anyone in the audience who supported the Council's plan.

Rob Day stated that 70% of respondents in the previous survey had indicated opposition to residential development on the site however Council wouldn't listen.

Nancy Tucker read a letter she had written to Council urging the provision of a multisports facility for children at the site to combat obesity and the reduction of play space in the community.

Bruce Winfield spoke in favour of Council's process in developing a plan for community consultation and urged the community to look seriously at the financial implications of any redevelopment of this site.

Megan Cox stated that the Richmond Raceway development had created a huge increase in rate revenue for Council and questioned where was that money being spent.

A resident advised that she believed the Mayor had announced the Concept Plan for East Fremantle Oval at a football lunch at East Fremantle Oval prior to the plan actually being adopted by Council.

Mayor Ferris advised that he had indeed made an announcement at a pre-match lunch at East Fremantle Oval however did not believe it was prior to Council's endorsement of the Plan. Mayor Ferris stated he would follow this up.

Con Tripi (President EFFF) advised that despite offers for the Club to relocate to other facilities, the East Fremantle Football Club was committed to remaining at East Fremantle Oval given its long association with the Town and the community. Mr Tripi advised that although match attendances were a far cry from past crowds, the Club's membership was slowly growing and was now around 2,000 members. Mr Tripi stated that the Club did not



particularly support the selling off of parts of the Reserve, however, acknowledged this would provide finance to redevelop the existing facilities.

Mr Bill Turner (President EFCC) stated that the error the consultants made in the Concept Plan when stating the area required for a standard croquet court did not give him confidence in the quality of the remainder of the report. Mr Turner stated that the small area occupied by the East Fremantle Croquet Club was probably the most utilised area of the whole A Class Reserve, with the clubhouse and grounds being used every day of the week by members, for social events and by other clubs such as a Bridge and Fishing clubs. Mr Turner also stated that the Croquet Club was keen to retain its separate club facilities and two full sized croquet courts. Mr Turner advised that they did not want the football club problems solved at the croquet club's expense.

Jason Langford stated that the deterioration of the oval facilities was as a result of poor management and believed the Council and the football club were jointly to blame.

Janet Bielby advised that no residential development should be contemplated given the serious existing water pressure problems experienced in the area. Mrs Bielby stated that given tonight's large attendance, local democracy should prevail.

Danielle Churack advised that she loved having the football club at East Fremantle Oval however the key asset needing preservation was the A Class Reserve, not the football club. Ms Churack expressed the view that the proposal for Allen Street would be better suited to the contour of the land fronting Moss Street and felt that East Fremantle Football Club needed to help fund any redevelopment.

John Rose stated that the results of the survey with 70% of 800 respondents against the proposal for residential/commercial development, was democracy at work and stated that there was an overwhelming feeling this plan was not a "goer".

David Edinger (EFFC Director & Allen Street resident) stated that the deteriorating infrastructure at East Fremantle Oval was a community problem, not solely a football club problem. Mr Edinger remarked on the very strong representations made by various residents tonight, especially from Jim O'Neill.

Mr O'Neill responded that his address was "passionate".

Mr Edinger stated that Mr O'Neill's opposition was due to the views he enjoyed of the oval being potentially affected.

Mr O'Neill vigorously objected to this statement and called upon the Mayor as Presiding Member to call on Mr Edinger to retract his statement. Mr O'Neill then sought the comment be recorded in the minutes of this meeting. Mr Edinger retracted the statement.

Mr Edinger then commented that Mr O'Neill had been part of earlier discussions with the Club in relation to the development of the Oval, over the years he had served on Council

Mr O'Neill strongly denied this claim, stating that as he lived opposite the Oval he had repeatedly declared a financial interest in the matter and had never participated in Council discussions or voted on matters related to the ground.

Rob Day advised that the issue of obtaining federal funding for remedial works at the Oval had been raised at the 2008 Electors' Meeting and asked whether funding options had been explored.

The CEO advised that following that meeting, approaches were made to the Federal Government, with respect to the "Rudd" economic stimulus funding. However Council was



advised that available funding and the size of the grants involved indicated that only two grants would be awarded in WA and the very short timelines indicated that only projects which were essentially ready to proceed immediately would be successful. It was consequently suggested by the Federal officers concerned that there was little point in Council making an application in the prevailing circumstances.

The CEO further advised that comprehensive approaches were also made to the WA Football Commission, the Department of Sport & Recreation and Lotterywest at the time, without success.

Arthur Marshall stated that the A Class Reserve should not be tampered with. He commented that aged care and residential units would not create revenue for the local clubs, and skateboard parks in other areas had attracted antisocial behaviour.

Alistair Norcross commented that the East Fremantle Football Club needed to look at internal fundraising and suggested they contact the Australian Sports Foundation for assistance. Mr Norcross considered significant fundraising could be generated by a club of this size.

Jim O'Neill – Peter Watson

This meeting calls upon the Town of East Fremantle Council to:

- *not proceed with any further planning of the rezoning of the East Fremantle A class reserve which is bounded by Marmion, Fletcher, Moss and Allen Streets and it remain as an A class reserve in its entirety*
- *leave the croquet and bowling clubs in their present locations with their current land holding.*
- *a community group be formed that will work with the Council to ensure better public access and passive recreational development and landscaping to the East Fremantle Oval A class reserve that better address it's A class reserve status and community recreational needs.*

Maureen Flynn requested that in response to a comment made earlier by Mayor Ferris that she wanted the Oval to remain as it is, it be placed on record that she did not say she didn't want change on the A Class Reserve and that the contrary was the case and that further, she wished to serve on any community working group formed to consider options for the site.

Rebecca James expressed her disappointment that no response had been received regarding requests for East Freo Farm to participate in consultation on the redevelopment of East Fremantle Oval and again requested that she be considered on any community working group.

Megan Cox stated that in 1903 John Pearce had donated 5 acres of land to the Town for recreation purposes and part of that was the A Class Reserve.

Danielle Churack advised that the late Jean Dines who had resided at 78 Allen Street had passed on many memories of the early days, including the Oval being used for storage by the Americans during the War and cannons being positioned at the four corners of the Reserve. Ms Churack thought it would be fitting to have some sort of landmark on the site to mark its former use.

Gerard McCann advised that he supported the motion. Mr McCann criticised Council's approach to consultation and stated that Council needed to commence with a blank slate to consider how the retention of the A Class Reserve could be achieved, whilst raising funds for the redevelopment of the site.

Ian Handcock advised that he supported the motion and warned that once the A Class Reserve was gone, the community would never get it back.



Reading from a copy of a letter from John Forrest, Damien Flynn stated that John Forrest in 1901 had placed the land "in trust to the people as a place of recreation". Mr Flynn stated Council members should be stewards for their citizens' assets, not salesmen.

Pat Newton advised that she lived on the other side of the highway and stated that the Town's reserves belong to everyone.

Helen Marshall requested that the motion be put and sought an indication of the for and againsts.

Jan Rodda expressed concern about the future of other reserves which are not A Class reserves, given the Manager Planning Services' remarks regarding Council being required to find space for 600 additional dwellings within the Town.

The motion was put.

Jim O'Neill – Peter Watson

This meeting calls upon the Town of East Fremantle Council to:

- **not proceed with any further planning of the rezoning of the East Fremantle A Class reserve which is bounded by Marmion, Fletcher, Moss and Allen Streets and it remain as an A class reserve in its entirety.**
 - **leave the croquet and bowling clubs in their present locations with their current land holding.**
 - **a community group be formed that will work with the Council to ensure better public access and passive recreational development and landscaping to the East Fremantle Oval A class reserve that better address it's A class reserve status and community recreational needs.**
- CARRIED

The vote was carried: approximately 127 for, 2 against and several absentions.

5.2.2 Condition of Town Hall

John Newton complained about the state of the exterior of the Town Hall and requested that work be carried out to clean the outside of the building and improve the garden surrounds and courtyard.

The Mayor undertook to have the area tidied up.

5.2.3 Woodside Hospital

Megan Cox queried whether Council could approach the Health Department regarding the condition of the lawn area at Woodside Hospital which, she stated, was not being watered.

The CEO advised that the Health Department would be contacted regarding the matter.

6. CLOSURE OF THE MEETING

There being no other business Mayor Ferris declared the meeting closed at 8.25pm.